Borderland Theory as a Conceptual Framework for Comparative Local US and Canadian History

Claire Parham
Siena College, Loudonville, New York, USA
Email: cparham@siena.edu

Received January 15th, 2013; revised February 25th, 2013; accepted March 4th, 2013

Copyright © 2013 Claire Parham. This is an open access article distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

My book From Great Wilderness to Seaway Towns: A Comparative History of Cornwall, Ontario and Massena, New York, 1784-2001 compared the two towns at different historical moments from 1784 to 2001 by utilizing Oscar Martinez’s borderland theory and argued that the shared experiences of Cornwall and Massena’s residents based on their borderland locations lead them to follow comparable patterns of social and economic development. As former American colonists, both area residents wanted to develop towns identical to their former communities. The founders of Cornwall and Massena and their descendants, therefore, challenged national values and beliefs and developed a distinctive society and culture of their own. In contrast to Seymour Lipset who argued that the organizing principles made the two countries different, my research suggests that Louis Hartz was closer to the mark when he stated “the differences between the two countries are less significant than the traits common to both.” To determine the how the lives of Massena and Cornwall residents’ lives were affected by their border locations, I highlighted key events and experiences that caused these men and women to develop common values and beliefs and adhered to the methodology of local historians.

Keywords: Canada; US Local

When I began researching the history of Massena, New York and Cornwall, Ontario in 1996 as a possible dissertation topic, I searched not only for historical documents, but also a methodology and theoretical framework to analyze the economic, political, and social values of these two border towns. The only literature that existed at that time either concerned the lives of residents on the US/Mexican border or the contrasting national values of the United States and Canada. I, therefore, like many local historians, came up with my own model and approach to evaluate the history of Massena and Cornwall. In “A Manifesto: The Defense and Illustration of Local History,” Paul Leuillet stated, “Sometimes for lack of a model, the local historian must invent a method of approach… For local history this method may differ from the method appropriate for general history—for the simple reason that a history of a sector must develop its own original hypothesis for discovery and inquiry” (Leuillet, 1977: p. 14). By using Oscar Martinez’s borderlands milieu theory and local history techniques as a methodological and research framework, I compiled my own interpretation of the relationship and differences between the residents of these two border towns.

Canadian and American scholars’ research comparing and contrasting the values, experiences, and beliefs of residents of these two nations has tended to reflect two broad schools of thought. Seymour Lipset laid the groundwork for the first hypothesis, known as the value-orientation theory in his 1963 paper, “The Value Patterns of Democracy: A Case Study in Comparative View.” Recently, in Continental Divide: The Values and Institutions of the United States and Canada, he surmised his 30-year sociological analysis of the cultural and institutional differences between Canada and the United States. Lipset made specific assertions about how the establishment of businesses, personal relationships, governments, and churches by Canadians and Americans reflected their opposing economic, social, and religious values. Since the American Revolution, all sectors of Canadian and American society have diverged because of the countries’ contrasting organizing principles. Canadians are more class aware, law-abiding, elitist, and collectively oriented, while Americans pride themselves on living in an egalitarian, classless society, and thrive on individualism and personal achievement. Even with the increasing melding of the economies and popular culture of Canada and the United States since World War II, fundamental developmental differences guarantee that the two nations will never be economically, socially, or politically identical (Lipset, 1990: pp. 120-122).

Many scholars questioned the relevance of Lipset’s value-orientation approach in explaining cultural changes in the United States and Canada after World War II. In 1973 Irving Horowitz challenged the contemporary merits of Lipset’s theory based on the growing economic and cultural similarities between the United States and Canada. In his essay, “The Hemispheric Connection: A Critique and Corrective to the Entrepreneurial Thesis of Development with Special Emphasis on the Canadian Case,” he argued that the behavioral and value differences between the United States and Canada were not historically linked to the nations’ conflicting revolutionary ide-
ologies, as Lipset suggested, but were instead based on a lag between the two countries’ social development. Once Canada completed its social and economic evolution, Horowitz stated, the country would become more like the United States and less like Great Britain. This transformation began following World War II, as the increasing level of crime, education, and religious participation in Canada narrowed the cultural gap between the United States and Canada. Horowitz, therefore, concluded that “Lipset’s thinking is premised on a continuation of pre-World War II tendencies rather than post World War II trends” (Horowitz, 1973: p. 346).

In the last fifteen years, numerous books have surfaced in which scholars compare the United States and Canada on a national level. Firstly, Fire and Ice: The United States, Canada, and the Myth of Converging Values’ author Michael Adams pointed out how Canadians and Americans are not getting more like each other, but instead are diverging in many important ways. Jason Kaufman who penned The Origins of Canadian and American Political Differences critiqued the public and political policy of the United States and Canada from colonialism to the present day by framing his argument around five specific differences between American and Canadian development: economic; collectivism, social services, and voter alignment; comparative federalism; individual and civil rights; and identity politics. Finally, David M. Thomas and Barbara Boyle Torrey’s five-section edited collection Canada and the United States: Differences that Count allowed various authors to comment on the values, politics, beliefs, and social policies of each nations’ leaders and citizens.

A second group of scholars offered a glimpse into the lives of border residents in the American and Canadian Pacific region. Led by Wallace Stegner’s Wolf Willow, a poignant reflection of growing up on the Montana/Saskatchewan border at the turn of the twentieth century, researchers in this new vein analyzed various aspects of life in borderland regions. Sterling Evans divided his contributors’ essays, The Borderlands of the American and Canadian Wests: Essays on Regional History of the Forty-Ninth Parallel, into five sections addressing regional definition, colonization of borderlands, agricultural economies and labor markets, and environmental issues. While both groups of comparative historians studied local and regional experiences, a void still exists in terms of the lives of residents in the North American Atlantic border region over an extended period of time.

In Border People: Life and Society in the US-Mexico Borderlands, Oscar Martinez outlined a set of criteria to evaluate the uniqueness of border town life and used oral interviews to prove his theory. His most useful tool for US and Canadian historians was his argument that inhabitants of border towns function in an environment called the “borderlands milieu”. These circumstances are defined as “unique forces, processes, and characteristics that set borderlands apart from interior zones” (Martinez, 1994: p. 10). According to Martinez, residents of border towns face the constant threat of foreign invasion, deal with heterogeneous populations, interact with foreigners, and feel separated or isolated from their countrymen.

Martinez also offered three models of borderland’s interaction: alienated, coexistent, interdependent, and integrated. He ascertained that the settlers of interdependent borderlands experience circumstances making their lives stand out from the national norm. Borderlanders witness a flow of money and people that created opportunity to establish social relationships across the border. This fluid relationship also fostered fear among men and women of outsiders because of their continued exposure to people of varying ethnic background. Due to their remote location, farmers, shopkeepers, and religious leaders acquired a sense of otherness and thought of themselves as different from people in interior regions. In the case of US/Canadian border, according to Martinez, several Hollywood films portrayed the border as a place that offered escape, a second chance, an opportunity to forget, and safety and comfort for those in need. Politically, town leaders have often seen laws as being made by distant, insensitive, and excessively nationalistic politicians. The sparse number of residents and voters and remoteness from centers of power limit their political clout often resulted in the proposals of their leaders for social and economic improvements being frequently ignored by decision makers. Finally, borderlanders differed from residents of their national heartland because of their exposure to foreign economies, increased employment opportunities, and consumer choices unavailable to those in heartland (Martinez, 1994: pp. 23 & 25).

My book From Great Wilderness to Seaway Towns: A Comparative History of Cornwall, Ontario and Massena, New York, 1784-2001 compared the two towns at different historical moments from 1784 to 2001 by utilizing Oscar Martinez’s borderland theory and argued that the shared experiences of Cornwall and Massena’s residents based on their borderland locations lead them to follow comparable patterns of social and economic development. As former American colonists, both area residents wanted to develop towns identical to their former communities. The founders of Cornwall and Massena and their descendants, therefore, challenged national values and beliefs and developed a distinctive society and culture of their own. In contrast to Seymour Lipset who argued that the organizing principles made the two countries different, my research suggested that Louis Hartz was closer to the mark when he stated “the differences between the two countries are less significant than the traits common to both” (Hartz, 1964: pp. 1-48).

To determine how their border locations affected the lives of Massena and Cornwall residents’ lives, I highlighted key events and experiences that caused these men and women to develop common values and beliefs and adhered to the methodology of local historians. In “A Manifesto: The Defense and Illustration of Local History” by Paul Leuilliot, he described the different techniques and elements of doing local history and chronicling the lives of common people. Firstly all of the research methods utilized by local historians are more flexible, more qualitative than quantitative, and many times experimental. Also, the researchers in this realm concern themselves with the invisible aspects of daily life impacting peoples’ values and beliefs including age-old traditions and folklore. Local history overflows into the history of mentalities, of attitudes toward life, death, money, and innovation. Unlike most historians, whose work centers on colossal events and actions of leaders on a national scale, I specifically exposed the differences in terms of values, development, and social and economic experiences of borderland residents in juxtaposition with their countrymen in other regions. As Leuilliot concluded, my concerns and methodology differed from academic and national historians and included both primary and secondary sources. I exposed the differences between national and local values and experiences and showed why the heartland of the United States and Canada is different from the borderland (Leuilliot, 1977: pp. 6-26).
In 2009, my book entitled *The St. Lawrence Seaway and Power Project: An Oral History of the Greatest Construction Show on Earth* expanded my analysis of the interplay between Cornwall and Massena residents with outsiders, the regional interdependence in terms of trade and social relationships, and the limited political clout of local leaders in terms of lobbying state and local officials for funding for social and infrastructure programs. As Martinez asserted, certain border regions experience a greater flow of economic and human resources across the border, greater trade and consumerism, and a sense of otherness from those in the interior sections that triggers fear of outsiders and a political inferiority complex. However, the lack of long-term social and economic impact of the St. Lawrence Seaway project on the area contradicted Martinez’s argument that borderland areas thrived after World War II both socially and economically. Instead my research supported Paul Leulliot’s assertion that local areas serve as indicators of future national trends. Both Cornwall and Massena residents witnessed deindustrialization and a loss of population due to the movement of manufacturers south in search of cheaper labor and operating costs.

**The Settlement of Cornwall and Massena**

Cornwall, Ontario and Massena, New York are two towns separated by a narrow expanse of the St. Lawrence River on the northern New York/Canadian border. Besides being close geographical neighbors, settlers arrived in each locale in the closing decades of the eighteenth century. In 1784 no longer welcome in the former colonies United Empire Loyalists and their families relocated to Royal Township #2, later renamed Cornwall. Northeastern farmers migrated to Massena leaving family homesteads in New England and New York in search of cheap and abundant land on the newly opened frontier. As Martinez suggested, both area’s founding families saw their new homes as places that offered a second chance and an opportunity to forget. Initially, both groups of settlers struggled to become economically self-sufficient and foster cultural and political institutions among a widespread and often transient population. Settlers’ shared spiritual beliefs gave them the strength to endure the harsh frontier conditions and enhanced their relationships with their neighbors.

Cornwall and Massena’s isolated borderland location encouraged these men and women to adopt contrasting religious values and beliefs to those in other regions of the United States and Canada. During the frontier days, in the absence of ministers, Cornwall and Massena inhabitants took charge of their spiritual lives by organizing congregations and recruiting new worshippers as a way to create social bonds between members of scattered and often transient populations. Many worshippers saw their faith as a way to deal with the harsh conditions and isolation of frontier living. Like the pioneers who settled the American West, the loyalists experienced starvation, financial uncertainty, and loneliness.

While many of the loyalists and their families practiced the more structured faiths of Presbyterianism, Anglicanism, and Roman Catholicism, recruiting full-time ministers and priests, proved difficult as many members of the British clergy viewed Canada as an unsettled frontier and its parishes as an undesirable assignment. Therefore, settlers started their own congregations and conducted their own services without the guidance of a minister. Lay readers not only presided over sporadic services, but also performed weddings and funerals. The Presbyterians, the most prominent faith in the area from the early days of settlement and traditionally one of the most nationally organized religions, altered the deference of local worshippers to the authority of church leaders as it had in the former American colonies. While Cornwall Presbyterians still accepted the Book of Common Prayer and stressed ceremony and Christian discipline, parishioners retained their ability to excommunicate members and to ordain their own minister. In 1839, 961 residents attended services at St. John’s Presbyterian Church (Upper Canada Return of Population and Assessment, Volume 1: p. 574).

Methodism appealed to many Cornwall residents based on its simple doctrines and organization and its evangelical traveling preachers. John Wesley, the faith’s creator, stressed the role of the individual in seeking salvation and preached that perfection was available to those who desired it with the aid of the Holy Spirit. While a superintendent oversaw and defined the circuits that traveling preachers serviced, it was the weekly class meetings that were the foundation of Methodism. Occasional camp meetings, held by two or more ministers, also served as a source of group consciousness based on shared spiritual values. These planned gatherings made settlers feel less isolated and part of a community. Ministers preached about the central values and motivation of settlers’ including self-sufficiency, social equality, and individualism. The conversion experience itself provided worshippers with a release from the anxiety and frustration associated with frontier life. By 1839, the number of Cornwall Methodists had risen to 160 (Upper Canada Return of Population and Assessment, Volume 1: p. 574).

The religious experience of Massena residents mirrored that of their Cornwall neighbors as they too organized congregational and voluntary associations. Between 1800 and 1840 Massena Congregationalists and Methodists met weekly for prayer services as traveling preachers only periodically visited. These loosely organized congregations served as the town’s central social and cultural organizations. Congregationalists also periodically reaffirmed and strengthened their spirituality by observing days of fasting and humiliation and attending weekly prayer meetings. This faith offered Massena settlers some regularity in their lives, while still appealing to their desires to have a personal relationship with God. During early settlement, the Methodists were the only challengers for the souls of the Massena faithful. Beginning in 1805, circuit riders charged with preaching to worshippers in Malone, Ogdensburg, Potsdam, and Massena infrequently conducted services in private homes and schoolhouses (Prince, 1961: p. 1). Most riders successfully gained new followers because, unlike their Protestant counterparts, they ventured into the backwoods areas and preached to members of the rural community.

**Political Organization**

Politically, the founding fathers of Cornwall saw the laws and structures that distant leaders requested they implement as insensitive and nationally oriented. Regardless of the fact that the loyalists and Massena residents now lived on opposite sides of the border, both still harbored comparable political goals and values. These former soldiers and prominent farmers did not desire a strong paternalistic government and did not defer to authority. Cornwall residents, unlike their counterparts in the neighboring towns of Alexandria and Kingston, never developed hierarchical political structures. Instead, Cornwall settlers,
similar to Massena residents, demanded a democratic, popularly elected government. Loyalists attempted to establish the same participatory government structure they had in their former home towns. Residents wanted town meetings and local courts administered by officials who concerned themselves solely with the financial and legal administration of the towns, and who did not interfere with individuals’ rights. While Cornwall loyalists initially failed in their efforts to gain a democratic local government, their protests exhibited their desire for the same political system that their American neighbors implemented after the Revolution. Like other frontiersmen, they insisted on a degree of political autonomy which set them apart from other Canadians and angered provincial government officials.

The attempt to establish an organized governing structure in Cornwall exposed the differing political beliefs of the former military commanders and common citizens. National government officials first attempted to formalize the structure of town government by ordering settlers of the royal townships to hold town meetings in 1787. In Cornwall a conflict arose between former military leaders, and local activists, over who should conduct the meetings and be eligible for election as town delegates. When the gathering was held on July 12, 1787, local activists led by Patrick McNiff forced Samuel Anderson, the current town magistrate and a group of fellow officers to leave the proceedings by threatening their lives. The citizens who remained at the meeting elected 10 representatives, including McNiff. However, Anderson and the other regiment commanders challenged the election. In response to the controversy, dominion officials set aside the idea of locally appointed officials administering town affairs, and instead created a regional and national political structure that controlled town affairs from above (Senior, 1983: p. 62, Report of Ten Inhabitants…, and Ensign Francis McCarty Deposition).

Massena residents established a democratic government from the town’s inception. In 1802 the New York State Legislature passed the original county charter empowering the residents of Massena to establish locally based legal and political structures. Judges of the court of common pleas and circuit court decided criminal and civil complaints, while town meetings administered by elected officials authorized the construction of roads, allotted funds for the poor, and dealt with other miscellaneous town matters. Early town officials included a supervisor, town clerk, assessor, overseer of the poor, commissioner of highways, and superintendent of schools. The first town meeting took place in Massena in 1803 at the home of Peter Tarbell. The locally elected Massena government concentrated on completing road projects and developing a social welfare system (Podgurski, Prince, & Peers, 1959: p. 5).

The Canal Era

For much of the nineteenth century, Massena and Cornwall politicians found their demands ignored by state and national officials concerning the development of waterpower along the St. Lawrence River, and therefore, took matters into their own hands. A debate raged over the practicality of constructing a canal for the purpose of converting the energy produced by the current of the St. Lawrence River into electricity for public and private use. Local citizens and politicians realized the economic opportunity offered by channeling this natural resource, but could not convince state officials of the validity of their proposal or garner the necessary private monies to bankroll the construction.

The members of the Upper Canada Parliament initially discussed the Cornwall canal project in 1816 because of the difficulties military commanders encountered transporting their troops and supplies up and down the St. Lawrence River during the War of 1812. In 1818 members of a provincially appointed commission studied the specific geographic and economic aspects of such an undertaking. Following lengthy parliamentary debates about the waterway’s merit and substantial price tag, national officials authorized the Cornwall Canal project on February 13, 1833. A decade later, contractors completed the original 11 1/2-mile-long canal. Constructed between 1834 and 1843, the Cornwall Canal, the third in a series of nationally funded projects built along the St. Lawrence River between Montreal and Cornwall, improved inland water transport and expanded the country’s hydro-generated power. However, soon after the conclusion of the project, the Canadian government’s transportation minister realized that the water depth and width of the locks could not adequately accommodate the ships of the age and improvements continued for several decades (Pringle, 1934: p. 3; The Chronological History…, 1934: p. 1).

The first political defeat in the US came in 1833 when local Massena officials presented a petition to the New York State Legislature that described the power canal and its potential financial attributes. While the proposition peaked the interest of enough of the members to warrant a feasibility survey, the enormous expense of the undertaking, including the purchase of large amounts of privately owned land, the employment of large numbers of workers, costly machinery and materials, compounded with the lack of industries to purchase the power, caused the proposal to be tabled until 1897. Learning from past mistakes, Henry Warren, a local real estate magnate, garnered an impressive list of five foreign investors committed to funding the multi-million dollar construction and acquired the property rights to the necessary land, prior to making a presentation to the legislature. Among the original investors was Albon Man, a long-time annual visitor to Massena Springs, who wished to give something back to the community that had furnished him with so many memorable vacations over the years. With Man’s help, Warren enlisted the financial backing of three of his friends, M. H. Flaherty, C. A. Kellogg and Charles Higgins—a situation that left the men in Albany with little choice but to approve the measure (Podgurski, Prince, & Peers, 1959: p. 7). Upon the project’s completion, it had silenced its critics by convincing the Pittsburgh Reduction Company to build a plant in Massena and lease power from the newly formed St. Lawrence River Power Company.

The Arrival of Foreigners

Cornwall and Massena’s locations near the canals forced residents to deal with foreigners sooner than their immediate neighbors. The Board of Works and private contractors employed more than 1000 Irish laborers on the Cornwall Canal between 1834 and 1842. Most laborers lived in shanty huts near the canal site and shopped at the company store. Poor living conditions and high unemployment rates led to violence. Historian J. F. Pringle notes, “Hundreds of men were employed on the various contracts and it was only natural that there should be a rough element that were constantly making trouble” (Pringle, 1934: p. 3; The Cornwall Canal, 1887: p. 1). Local inhabi-
tants distrusted the Irish canal workers and expected them to abide by the law and adopt Canadian religious and social values. As Oscar Martinez indicates, “In the case of isolated villages, discord with other groups may arise out of fear and resentment triggered by encroachment from outsiders” (Martinez, 1994: p. 17).

When canal workers murdered deputy sheriff Ewen Stuart in 1834 and former lieutenant governor Albert French two years later, animosity arose between the Irish laborers and long-time Cornwall inhabitants, and exposed the latter’s fear and lack of tolerance for immigrants. After canal workers repeatedly committed violent crimes, many residents considered the roads bordering the canal unsafe for travel and took alternate routes. In September 1835, Cornwall magistrates applied to Lieutenant Governor John Colbourne for military assistance in maintaining order and public safety until the project’s completion. According to a Cornwall Observer editor, “After this sacrifice of one of our most respected townsmen, Sir John Colbourne cannot refuse two companies at least to guard our jail and maintain our laws” (Editorial, 1834: p. 1). In 1836, the troops arrived and remained stationed in Cornwall until 1843.

Lehigh Construction managers promised Massena town officials at the inception of construction in 1897 that the canal workers and their families brought to Massena to work on the waterway project would not negatively affect the surrounding community. As company officials strove to be self-sufficient in terms of housing and supplies, they constructed Camp Bogart on the north side of town consisting of a dining hall, kitchen, and several 20 by 50 feet buildings, each housing up to three workers and their families. As the project progressed, there was not enough room at Camp Bogart for the increasing number of workers, and many were forced to live in shacks or sand dug-outs made of old boxes and lumber near the canal site. The cluster of primitive buildings, referred to as White City, was located on North Main Street, and extended from the town border to the canal site. According to local journalist, Anthony Romeo, “Life during the canal days was appalling. The Italian and Hungarian workers and their families spent subzero winter nights in tarpaper shacks with no running water” (Romeo, 1961: p. 2).

Town residents became increasingly worried about the surge in crimes committed by canal workers, much of which was reported in the local newspaper. Canal workers not only got into frequent skirmishes with each other, but also with the St. Regis Indians. This behavior reinforced Massena residents’ aversion to foreigners. The Massena police chief did not hire additional constables as most job foremen preferred to person-
From 1870 to 1891 many French Canadians from surrounding towns and impoverished British subjects from overseas came to Montreal in search of employment. Unlike many areas of Canada during these decades where town officials battled a recession, Cornwall leaders welcomed three new mills, whose employment needs exceeded the local supply. With the poor conditions in the surrounding rural areas, French Canadians moved into town to fill these new factory jobs. By the turn of the century, 1105 individuals had immigrated to Cornwall, with 466 new residents arriving between 1881 and 1890. The town’s total population increased from 5081 in 1871 to 6790 in 1891 (Census of Canada, 1871: Table 4, p. 274; Census of Canada, 1901: Table 17, p. 459; Census of Canada, 1941: Table 10, p. 113). As French Canadians spoke a different language from existing residents, they relied on each other for financial and spiritual support and security. In Cornwall the Quebecois became active members in the Catholic Church as a means of dealing with their new unfamiliar surroundings.

The abundance of inexpensive power created by the Massena canal caught the attention of the nation’s largest aluminum processing company—Pittsburgh Reduction Company—later known as the Aluminum Company of America (Alcoa). Founded in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania in 1888 under the watchful eye of Charles Martin Hall, the inventor of a low cost way of producing aluminum, and with the financial backing of a group of young entrepreneurs headed by Alfred Hunt, the company monopolized the national market within a few short years. For almost a decade, the Pittsburgh Reduction Company resisted expansion and concentrated on improving its Pittsburgh operation. But, the constant protesting of workers and the astronomical price of electricity encouraged the company to seek alternate manufacturing sites with more favorable conditions, first in Niagara Falls in 1895 and seven years later in Massena near the new power canal. The locale presented the company with two long sought luxuries—affordable electricity and a docile labor supply (Carr, 1952: p. 2).

Following a May 15, 1902 visit to Massena by company executives Arthur Davis, Charles Hall, and E. S. Fickes, Pittsburgh Reduction purchased 100 acres of land east of the canal. Two months later contractors began construction of a $1 million facility that included five 550-feet long production buildings, a storage yard, and company-owned railroad tracks. Alcoa officials also purchased the entire annual output of the newly established American Reduction Company, a macaroni factory, and a lingerie factory. These businesses provided jobs for the wives and daughters of aluminum workers and local female residents who wanted to supplement their family’s income. Also the construction of Diamond Cremer in 1907, a cooperative producer of condensed milk financed by farmers and local investors, served as another source of employment outside of farming and aluminum production.

Massena’s population and social life changed with the influx of foreigners to work at Alcoa. The town’s population quadrupled and diversified with the arrival of European immigrants. These immigrants initially consisted of Italians and Jews from New York City, and later of recent arrivals from Eastern Europe, Central America, and Scandinavia who adhered to different cultures and religious traditions that taxed the patience of local residents and stressed the available housing market. The transformation that took place in the first half of the twentieth century pressured this small town to come to terms with its new identity as an industrial center and with the difficulties of dealing with a diverse population.

To combat local residents’ uneasiness, Pittsburgh Reduction officials constructed separate housing for workers and managers in previously undeveloped areas of town. Throughout the next several decades, Alcoa officials also enrolled their immigrant workers in company-sponsored Americanization programs, in which instructors taught new families the English language and the basic elements of American history. On a municipal level town councilors approved funding for a larger police force and the construction of more schools to accommodate the increasing number of school-age children. However, the implementation of these initiatives did not erase the intolerance community members held for outsiders and their unfamiliar customs.

In addition to dictating where its workers’ resided, Alcoa controlled other aspects of their lives as a preventative measure to guard against complaints about unruly behavior outside the factory walls. Doctors treated injured workers and the ailments of their immediate family in an on-site hospital in order to dispel the idea that immigrants had poor hygiene, lacked respect for medical care, and therefore, contributed to the ill health of the community and burdened local health care facilities. Company officials also organized bowling leagues and created a local baseball team that played matches against neighboring towns. Both measures gave members of the community and Alcoa workers a common social experience with the hopes of improving the tenuous personal relations. However, company executives underestimated the power of the long history of local biases and dislike for outsiders that dated back to the early encounters with the St. Regis Indians. It would take more than fancy housing and sports teams to overcome these heartfelt feelings.

A local reporter provided the first documented example of the misconceptions Massena residents harbored about immigrants in his account of a visit to 600 illegal Chinese immigrants detained at the county jail in 1901. Under the title, “Hundreds of Chinese: Yellow Tide Still Streams,” the writer told of the deplorable conditions in the jail where the Chinese men were housed and described it as the “black hole of Callcuta”, an obvious reference to the perception of the poor living conditions in India. He continued by expressing amazement at the jovial attitudes of the inmates and assumed that this behavior was based on the conditions at the jail being more favorable than those left behind in their homeland. In the remainder of his
commentary, the writer repeatedly exhibited his ignorance of foreign cultures and his support of the popular opinion that Asians were naturally weak and childlike. The most memorable portion of the article detailed the attempts by local boys to teach the Chinese how to play American football. Throughout this example, the author compared the awkwardness of the physical movement of the Chinese in comparison to the skillfulness of the young Americans highlighting his narrowmindedness and intolerance for foreign cultures (Hundreds of Chinese..., 1901: p. 6).

**The Seaway Politicians**

Politically both towns’ leaders continued to be ignored in the twentieth century by state lawmakers in their quest to improve their regional economies and future prospects with the construction of the St. Lawrence Seaway and Power project. Based on the remoteness of the area and the sparse number of voters, in order for their voices to be heard, their campaigns lasted decades and finally achieved their goals when national security matters added a global component to their demands. Without the effort of these individuals, the Seaway would have slipped off the national radar without being constructed. Most Cornwall and Massena politicians believed the future economic survival of the region hinged on the completion of the St. Lawrence Seaway project. Aaron Horovitz, Lionel Chevrier, Thomas Bushnell, and Dr. Rollin Newton all recognized the potential of the cheap water power and transportation for attracting new businesses. They spent their lives pressing for the passage of Seaway legislation by Canadian and US national officials. Without the perseverance of these men, the project never would have come to fruition.

Aaron Horovitz was the most influential and longest serving twentieth century Cornwall politician. Horovitz, a native of Romania, established the Prince Clothing Company along with his brother Louis in 1911. In 1930 Horovitz became the mayor of Cornwall and the first Jewish leader of a Canadian town. Between 1930 and 1956 Horovitz occupied the mayor’s office for 18 years, the longest tenure in Cornwall history. His expertise as a business owner helped him settle the labor disputes and intolerant for foreign cultures (Hundreds of Chinese..., 1901: p. 6).

Lionel Chevrier earned the title as one of the most well-known national leaders from Cornwall in the twentieth century. He was hailed by the press and the people of Cornwall in the 1950s as “Mr. Seaway” due to his efforts from 1930 to 1953 to convince Canadian and American officials to pass the St. Lawrence Seaway legislation. Chevrier was born in Cornwall in 1903, the son of Joseph Chevrier and the former Melvina De-Repentigny, both French Canadian Catholics. His parents came to Cornwall on their honeymoon and moved to the area in 1890 because of the promising business opportunities. By the time Lionel was born, his father, Joseph, owned a thriving grocery business and later became a Centre Ward councilor and Cornwall’s first French Canadian mayor (Good, 1987: p. 15).

Chevrier followed in his father’s footsteps in terms of political and inherited his father’s dream of constructing the Seaway. Lionel attended the Centre Ward Separate School and the Cornwall Collegiate Institute before enrolling at the University of Ottawa in 1917. Following graduation he attended a seminar for a year and then went to law school at Osgoode Hall. Lionel was admitted to the bar in 1928 and set up a practice with George Stiles, a well-known Cornwall lawyer, and Howard Hessell, a former classmate. Upon his return to his native town, he became a member of the Board of Trade and was appointed secretary of that organization from 1931 to 1934. In that position he prepared and presented an in-depth study regarding all the ramifications and possible local effects of the proposed St. Lawrence Seaway project. A summary of the information Chevrier uncovered was released to the public and he made numerous speeches to civic organizations. His report put the Seaway back on the national political agenda in the US and Canada. According to biographer Mabel Tinkiss Good, this research project on the Seaway and his connection with the board brought Chevrier into the national spotlight and led him into an unplanned political career. When the liberal party leadership sought a spirited and well-spoken political candidate for one of Ontario’s parliamentary seats in 1935, Chevrier fit the bill (Good, 1987: p. 51).

In 1935 Chevrier won a seat in Parliament for the Liberal party. He began a three-decade-long undefeated political career highlighted by his constant efforts to promote the Seaway. In May 1943 Chevrier was appointed assistant to the Minister of Munitions and Supply, C. D. Howe, in the Mackenzie King government. Two years later, King appointed him Minister of Transport offering him the perfect opportunity to promote the Seaway project at home and abroad. By January 1953, Chevrier and other leaders, including Prime Minister Laurent recognized that American interest in the waterway and power project had dwindled and determined that Canadian contractors should complete the project exclusively on the Canadian side. Months later, President Harry S. Truman and the US Congress passed the Wiley-Dondero bill and the project was undertaken jointly. In 1954 Chevrier assumed the post of president of the St. Lawrence Seaway Authority, a position he held for three years (Good, 1987: pp. 53-56).

During the Great Depression and times of global conflict, the leaders of Massena also kept the vision of the Seaway alive as state and national leaders paid more attention to social programs and the war effort. All of the leaders of Massena prior to the construction of the St. Lawrence Seaway spoke of the project as the key to the area’s future economic success. Their lifelong commitment, public campaigning, lettering writing, and speech making led national leaders to approve the St. Lawrence...
Seaway bill.

Thomas Bushnell had a long local political career, but his dedication to the Seaway project caught the eye of state officials almost garnering him a coveted trustee position in the newly formed New York State Power Authority in 1943. He was born in 1889 in Palmyra, New York, a town between Rochester and Syracuse, the son of a Civil War veteran.

Bushnell lost his first mayoral race to W. Gilbert Hawes by three votes in 1929. Bushnell defeated Hawes two years later by a margin of 1312 to 1037. In 1933 Bushnell was challenged by Ira Dishaw, but won the contest 1364 to 1062. Two years earlier he was considered by local Democrats and Republicans as a strong contender for one of the trustee positions with the New York State Power Authority. Although he was not appointed to the board by Governor William Harriman, Bushnell remained a strong proponent of the Seaway and for a time became the project’s unofficial spokesmen. As mayor he had traveled with other area politicians and business leaders to the Hotel Franklin in Malone to encourage Warren Thayer, a state senator from Chateaugay, to cast his vote in favor of the Power Authority bill. Bushnell also presented a speech at a meeting of the Great Lakes Association in Toronto in 1934 in which he expressed support for the Seaway project and its benefits for Massena. The following year he lost the mayoral race to Dr. Rollin Newton (Prince, 1967: p. 5).

Dr. Rollin Newton was the most important leader in Massena in first half of twentieth century. He was a major supporter of the Seaway project, a champion of infrastructure improvements, including better roads and sewers, and the benefactor of the town’s first hospital. Newton was born in Stockholm, New York in 1872. He attended Brasher and Stockholm High School and graduated from Potsdam Normal School in 1896. Prior to entering the University of Buffalo Dentistry College, Newton studied law under Judge Preston in Parishville and taught at his alma mater. Upon completion of dental school, he operated practices in Troy and Parishville, New York before assuming the patients of Dr. C. S. Ober in Massena in 1900. While Newton arrived in Massena by train, his father brought his dental equipment by sleigh. He opened his first office in the Russell business block, but moved his practice several times over the next five decades (Prince, 1967: p. 5).

Like Bushnell, Newton became convinced of the imminent federal approval of the Seaway and power project and made it his life’s mission to keep the project in the national spotlight as well as garner support from other local residents. His most rudimentary method of spreading the gospel of the Seaway was to explain the social and economic promise for the area during and after the construction of the various facilities to any captive audience including many of his dental patients undergoing lengthy procedures. In an article in the Massena Observer, publisher Leonard Prince described his first teeth cleaning experience in 1928 and being apprised of the many reasons why the Seaway needed to be built and assured that the United States Congress would pass the project bill during its next session. Prince admits that while his hope waned as the years passed and no construction began, Massena natives led by Newton remained confident the Seaway would eventually be completed (Prince, 1967: p. 6).

After Newton conceded defeat to O. T. McGuigan in 1945, he turned his attention full-time to convincing state and federal lawmakers of the urgency of passing the St. Lawrence Seaway legislation. As President of the Northern Federation Chamber of Commerce, he wrote to Senator George Aiken of Vermont, a long-time supporter of the Seaway, and attached a press statement sent to the Rochester Times Union, Syracuse Post Standard, and Buffalo Evening News. The opinion piece outlined the importance of developing the hydro-electric potential of the St. Lawrence River and challenged Seaway opponents to a public debate (Newton, 1945).

Contrary to most borderland residents, Horovitz, Chevrier, Bushnell, and Newton demanded the attention of state and federal policymakers and gained redemption for their efforts when the Seaway project commenced in 1954. The persistence of local leaders kept the Seaway in the spotlight. This group recognized the reluctance of state and national officials to provide funding for any economic or social programs that did not appeal to a national constituency and took it upon themselves to become the promoters of the economic future of the region. As Martinez indicated national politicians foster laws and policies that impact the masses and often neglecting isolated border areas. However, even with little political clout, Chevrier rose to a national leadership position and was able to gain passage of the Seaway and power dam project that for several decades fostered the economic prosperity of Cornwall, his hometown. Rather then sit back idly and criticize distant federal officials, each learned to work the system and the media to his advantage and gained prominence through hard work and perseverance.

The St. Lawrence Seaway and Power Project

The St. Lawrence Seaway and Power Project is often referred to as the “eighth wonder of the world.” Covering 265 miles from Montreal, Quebec to the Great Lakes, the undertaking remains the largest jointly-built power production and waterway in the twentieth century. Twenty-two thousand workers labored on the simultaneously built, five sections of the project erecting dams and locks and dredging channels. On the Canadian side, engineers, property agents, and carpenters acquired and flooded 22,000 acres and seven villages, and moved 531 houses and 18 cemeteries. Operating engineers manned $75 million in equipment, while laborers poured six million cubic yards of concrete in all weather conditions (Parham, 2009). Dedicated contractors and their employees made financial and personal sacrifices to finish the job on time and on budget.

From 1954 to 1958, Massena and Cornwall residents witnessed an invasion of transient workers with different accents, religious beliefs, and social lives due to their towns’ roles as the headquarters of the Seaway and Power Project. Prior to 1954, local politicians, church leaders, and school principals had dealt with issues related to the arrival of new residents with differing values and traditions during canal construction in the nineteenth century and the successive period of industrialization. Cornwall and Massena residents mutually disliked their towns being invaded by outsiders and even though Seaway and power dam workers and their families temporarily altered Cornwall and Massena’s populations and social institutions, residents’ clung to their regional identity. Historically, the residents of these two border towns had been exposed to outsiders from various regions of the country with different social and religious values sooner than their more homogeneous rural neighbors. But as in the past, residents would resist the cultural and social change and try to cling to their traditional values.

C. PARHAM
In August 1957 during the peak of construction on the US side PASNY contractors employed 6672, while Ontario Hydro contractors employed 6007 in June 1956. The maximum combined employment of 11,924 skilled and unskilled workers was recorded by Seaway officials in August 1957 (Parham, 2009). According to David Manley, a fifteen year old laborer on the project, “Some of the workers were local including some Indians from the reservation. Others came from Georgia, Alabama, Florida, and Virginia, particularly the engineers. Many worked in the spring and summer and returned home in the winter because of the cold” (D. Manley, personal communication, July 24, 2004).

On the Canadian side Bob Goodrich, the head of the employment office for Ontario Hydro, indicated that many of men constructing the Canadian side of the power dam had worked on the Niagara Falls project that had just been completed by Hydro. At that time, the agency had a core group of workers who moved from one power project to another. Other workers were from Cornwall or recruited through the Employment Service Office as demand warranted (B. Goodrich, personal communication, March 6, 2004).

John Dumas, the son of a Watertown Daily Times reporter, described the diversity of workers who came to live and work in his home town. “I am not sure there was any mold to build the construction workers that came here. They were all kind of different. We had one that stayed at our house as a matter of fact. We had a large four bedroom house in downtown Massena and used only three, so my grandmother rented a room to a construction worker. Our renter was a nice old southern man named, Seth. He told some great stories about going out in the woods of Kentucky or Louisiana and picking up a bear cub and trying to outrun Mama bear” (J. Dumas, personal communication, August 3, 2004).

College students comprised a large portion of the seasonal worker population in the US and Canada. During the summer months, they often filled laborers or machine operators’ jobs. David Flewelling asserted, “In 1957 I was nineteen and I flunked of college. As part of a northeastern cooperative program I had spent previous summers making a dollar an hour as a labor foreman and chief laborer. In March of 1957 I hitch-hiked from Pine River Junction to Massena, New York. The St. Lawrence Seaway was a big draw in those days because workers were in short supply and contractors were paying men high wages. I was hired the first week I was there by Perini as a draftsman on the Grasse River Lock doing rebar lift drawing. I was there from March until mid-July” (D. Flewelling, personal communication, November 30, 2004).

Besides diversifying the population of Massena and Cornwall, the Seaway workers and their wives established social relationships on both sides of the border allowing for a cultural transfer to take place through extensive border crossings and increased trade and consumer consumption. As Ambrose Andre, a concrete inspector for the Corps of Engineers explained, “I met my wife one Friday night at Picky’s bar. She was a school teacher and was there with a friend. We chatted a little and to make a long story short, my friend and I picked them both up. The fellow I was with knew them both, so that helped. I took her home and made plans for a date a few nights later and we were married six months later” (A. Andre, personal communication, July 17, 2004).

Ray Singleton who worked on the American side as an operating engineer married a women from Cornwall exemplifying the cross border interaction highlighted by Martinez. “We went on strike in Massena and I spent a lot of time at the bars. That is when I met, Melba, the gal I married” (R. Singleton, personal communication, June 22, 2005). His wife Melba elaborated, “I would go over to Massena with four or five of my friends including my best friend Bessie, who had a little black car. We would drive over to dance and have a good time and go home. We were all in our late twenties and worked for Bell Telephone. A lot of people from Cornwall traveled to Massena and spent an evening over there. Cornwall didn’t have places like that where you could go and dance and have a drink” (M. Singleton, personal communication, June 4, 2005). John Dumas explained, “At that point in time Cornwall’s drinking age was 21 and ours was 18. Because of the lower drinking age, the Canadians were attracted over here by the droves” (J. Dumas, personal communication, August 3, 2004).

Seaway workers and their wives also enjoyed Massena’s borderland location as it allowed greater access to shopping and personal services. Joyce Eastin, the wife of an Ulh, Hall and Rich engineer, reminisced, “I remember one time several of us went shopping in Cornwall. We would go and shop and stop and have lunch and come home particularly when the kids were in school” (J. Easton, personal communication, February 26, 2005). Her friend Ann Marmo added, “One of my favorite places to shop and get my hair done was across the river in Cornwall. I don’t think I thought there were any good beauticians at the time in Massena. In those days the prices were much better in Canada than in the US especially on woolens goods, and clothing, so some of us would go over for the whole day and have some fun. We were different than the local women” (A. Marmo, personal communication, June 15, 2005).

Even the workers enjoyed the ability to cross the border to buy consumer goods. Jim Cotter explained, “We could go over to tailor shops in Canada and get tailor made clothing because subsequent to World War II Canadians encouraged skilled craftsmen from Europe to migrate to Canada and so there were things available over there that weren’t available on the American side. They had some great hardware stores where you could find horseshoes that you couldn’t find west of the Mississippi” (J. Cotter, personal communication, September 11, 2004).

The construction of the St. Lawrence Seaway was portrayed as an economic bonanza for Massena and the surrounding St. Lawrence County communities that bordered the St. Lawrence River. Numerous reports were published that marketed the area as a perfect location for manufacturing firms due to the availability of cheap electricity and the easy access to the Great Lakes and the Atlantic for transportation of finished goods. Plans were drawn up for the reconstruction of the town’s roads and five schools were erected to accommodate the current and anticipated long-term increase in school aged children. However, once the bulldozers left town, the project had only enticed one new manufacturing operation, and the talk of economic grandeur fell by the wayside. The neighboring Canadian town of Cornwall, however, managed to take advantage of the opportunity and until recently was referred to as the southern capital of Ontario. The reason for Massena’s lack of progress and failure to live up to the expectations of the Seaway planners has long been debated by local economic development officials. A main component of this stagnation can be credited to the area’s historically ethnocentric mentality and its desire not to revisit past social problems.
Conclusion

From the early days of settlement, the men and women of Cornwall and Massena created organizations that benefited and complemented their lifestyles in terms of government structures and houses of worship. Due to their isolated locations on their nation’s periphery, these residents thought of themselves as different from people in the interior sections, causing a sense of otherness reflected in their development of similar economic, social, and political values and practices. They often saw laws as rules made by distant, insensitive and excessively nationalist politicians and often dealt with unruly residents and immigrant workers as they saw fit. The sparse number of voters and their distance from the center of power should have limited their political clout resulting in their demands for social and economic assistance and improvements being frequently ignored by decision makers. However, both area business men and politicians raised the money and garnered national approval for the construction of canals and eventually rallied for the construction of the St. Lawrence Seaway and power project. When national and state officials ignored these areas based on their isolated location, local leaders who had garnered political office based on their visions of the future forged ahead with their demands and kept them in the national spotlight even when their terms in office ended.

According to Martinez, towns like Massena and Cornwall should not have prospered or attracted manufacturing prior to the end of World War II. This however, is one of the main areas where the border towns in northeastern New York and southern Canada differed from those on the Mexican/US border. Their economic success in the nineteenth and early twentieth century occurred solely based on their geographical location that up until that point had been a disadvantage. The accessibility for manufacturers to cheap water power, navigable waterways, and non-union workers coupled with financial incentives from local government officials resulted in the industrialization of these two towns earlier than in other areas. Increasingly, the workers who manned the machines at these factories spoke different languages and harbored spiritual and cultural values and continued to diversify the population of Cornwall and Massena sooner than other regions. Crimes committed by these new arrivals often led to ethnic tension and social uneasiness that was played out on the front pages of the newspapers and in the criminal courts.

While the St. Lawrence Seaway and Power Project had been portrayed by economists and politicians as an economic bonanza, for the residents of Cornwall and Massena, it was another bout with an invasion of outsiders who threatened their quiet small town lives. At the beginning of the Seaway project in 1954, Cornwall and Massena residents still harbored a mutual dislike for men and women who held different spiritual beliefs or spoke a foreign language. Area inhabitants found the untamed lifestyle of Seaway workers to be unacceptable, and tried to curb their behavior with an increase in law enforcement and crime prevention initiatives. Local parish leaders also added extra Sunday services to accommodate workers’ schedules. While Massena natives on the surface appeared more accepting of newcomers, they were happy to see them leave after the project’s completion. With these workers came new cultures and religious traditions that taxed the patience of local residents.

The borderland location of Massena and Cornwall offered opportunities for greater consumer choices and transborder human relations for workers, their wives, and many single women during the St. Lawrence Seaway and Power Project. Many crossed the border to shop, dine, or meet a prospective mate. The geographical location of these two towns offered a unique experience for workers and their families, most of whom had labored on and lived near projects being constructed in the middle of nowhere. In this case, these temporary borderlanders established social and economic relationships across the border as had early settlers. These shared experiences fostered the development of similar beliefs and values that stood out from the national norm. As Jim Cotter, an engineer on the Seaway project concluded, “I’ve always felt that Massena residents due to their closeness to the Canadian border felt a greater attachment to Canada then they did to the United States” (J. Cotter, personal communication, September 11, 2004).

My research, therefore, offers a new interpretation of the life of residents on the US/Canadian border since the American Revolution. Like other borderlanders around the globe, Cornwall and Massena residents lived in a unique human environment and developed a set of values and beliefs that contrasted that of their compatriots in the heartland based on shared social and economic experiences. By exploring the lives of common people and being flexible with my analysis and source material, I uncovered a different perspective to existing US/Canada history that has an ideological, national or northwestern focus. Combining the techniques of local historians and the theory of Mexican/US border scholars, I have provided a framework for other scholars to expose the differences in values, economic progress, and social ethnocentrism of local border residents in the US and Canada from those in the heartland.

REFERENCES


Census of Canada (1871). Table 4, 274.

Census of Canada (1901). Table 17, 459.

Census of Canada (1909). Table 17, 459.

Census of Canada (1941). Table 10, 113.


Massena Alcoan 50th Anniversary Issue, June 1952.
Massena Manuscript Census, 1905-1925.
Newton, R. A. (1945). Correspondence to Senator George Aiken.
New York State Census, 1845, 1855 and 1875.
Report of Ten Inhabitants of Township #2 on Meeting of 12 January 1787.
The Cornwall Canal (1887). Cornwall Observer, 1.
Town Council Minutes (1878) 412-413.
Upper Canada Returns of Population and Assessment, Volume 1, 574.